Bernadette Rosbrook

Something More Immigrant Mothers in Anzia Yezierska's Early Fiction

An immigrant from Polish Russia, Anzia Yezierska rose to fame in America in the 1920s. Her early writing was critically acclaimed. Marketed by the press as a "sweatshop Cinderella" (Dearborn, 1988: 145), Yezierska became a wellknown public figure. But by the end of the '20s, critics were tiring of her fiction and by the middle of the 1930s she had dropped from public attention. Yezierska lived in relative obscurity for the rest of her life, her fiction apparently forgotten until rediscovered by feminist scholars in the 1970s. Much current discussion of Yezierska's writing focuses on her treatment of the dilemma of immigrant identity. In this article, I would like to address the theme of mothering in Yezierska's best-known work—her early stories, focusing in particular on the way in which her treatment of the mother figure in these stories attests to her involvement with early twentieth century American feminism. Specifically, I will argue that Yezierska's early mother-narratives reflect her exposure to a new awareness of female identity that was being vigorously discussed by Greenwich Village feminists—amongst whom she lived and socialized in the early 1900s (Dearborn, 1988: 50, 67).

Anzia Yezierska's first published story, "The Free Vacation House," is about the experiences of a young immigrant mother with a large family living in a tenement slum on New York's Lower East Side. Published in 1915 and based on an incident in the life of her sister, Helena Katz (Henriksen, 1988: 21), the story was written several years after Yezierska's departure from the Jewish ghetto. Yezierska had left her parent's home in about 1898, when she was approximately eighteen years old (Henriksen, 1988: 17), and had left the ghetto in about 1902 (Dearborn, 1988: 50). In between leaving her family and embarking on a writing career, Yezierska had worked in sweatshops, attended night school, graduated from Columbia University's Teachers College, worked

as a domestic science teacher, lived and attended classes at the socialist Rand School and studied at the American Academy of Dramatic Arts. She had also married twice, lived for a time with a wealthy sister on the West Coast and given birth to a daughter.² Given her experience of various roles and milieus, it is interesting that Yezierska begins writing with the figure of the ghetto mother firmly at the center of her narrative. In addition to "The Free Vacation House," her first published book, *Hungry Hearts*, contains three other stories—"The Lost Beautifulness," "The Fat of the Land" and "Where Lovers Dream"—which focus on the lives of immigrant mothers.

There is a certain logic to Yezierska's early concern with the figure of the mother: she is, in effect, beginning at the beginning. If, as Mary Dearborn suggests, writing, for Yezierska, was closely linked to issues of identity (1988: 81), then it makes sense that her writing starts at the place where identity formation must begin: with the family and particularly with the mother.³ Further, as a woman in her thirties, experiencing motherhood for the first time, it is not surprising that Yezierska was compelled to think and write about the lives of the ghetto mothers she grew up amongst. But something else is going on in these stories. While Yezierska's re-engagement with the life of the mother may be attributable to her personal experiences of mothering and being mothered, it is important to recognise that these depictions of immigrant women exemplify an understanding of femaleness that is consistent with the concerns of early twentieth century feminism.

Recognizing something more

Looking on the lives of immigrant mothers, Yezierska dwells repeatedly on themes of defeat. As JoAnn Pavletich notes, Yezierska's narratives "represent the poverty-stricken lives of brutally exploited immigrants" (2000: 98). Her mothers are condemned to loveless marriages, evicted from their homes, humiliated by charity organisations, rejected by their children. Significantly though, the tragedy of the mother's life is not portrayed solely in terms of external oppressions.

The pathos of Yezierska's short stories comes from her recognition that these Old World women, oppressed as they are, are yet responsive to love and beauty. Moreover, they are aware of something inside themselves that is inherently worthwhile. They have an intense self-respect, they value their autonomy and they yearn for self-expression. Yezierska's mother-protagonists display an understanding of themselves as individuals. That her protagonists are well aware of their own substantial worth as individuals accentuates the bitterness of their oppression. Recognising the value of what they possess inside themselves, these women feel their degradation as a kind of physical pain. By conveying both the mothers' self-knowledge and their deprivations, Yezierska communicates the intensity of their loss of self: the extent to which they feel, but are powerless to redress, the damage and injury that has been done to them.

A new view of womanhood: Yezierska and the Greenwich Village feminists

A new awareness of female individuality underpinned the changing selfconsciousness amongst early twentieth-century women that contributed to the birth of the new feminist movement. In Beyond Separate Spheres: The Intellectual Roots of Modern Feminism, Rosalind Rosenberg charts the transition from the Victorian commitment to "the unalterable nature of femininity"—the idea that women are "by nature, emotional and passive" (1982: xiv), with "superior ethical insight and nurturant qualities" (xiii)—to a modern insistence that "the vast majority of observable sex differences could be traced to cultural conditioning" (xiv) and a modern belief in women's "uncharted potential" (53). In The Grounding of Modern Feminism, Nancy Cott argues that an awareness of female individuality distinguished twentieth century feminism from the ideals of female activists of a previous era. Cott points out that nineteenth century women activists, with their emphasis on "the advancement of woman or the cause of woman, woman's right and woman's suffrage [emphasis added]" (1987: 3), had endorsed the idea that femaleness was defined by a group of innate characteristics. Their consistent usage of the singular "woman" symbolized their belief in "the unity of the female sex. It proposed that all women have one cause, one movement" (7). The term "feminism" came into common usage in the 1910s, and in contrast to the activists of an earlier era, women who called themselves feminists made "the variability among women a principle of their outlook [emphasis added]" (7). As an ideology, feminism presupposed a set of principles "not necessarily belonging to every woman—nor limited to women" (3).

An important rallying point for the new feminism was the Heterodoxy Club, formed in Greenwich Village in 1912. The members of the club were "inner-directed and individualistic" (Rosenberg, 1992: 65), united only by their commitment to unorthodox thinking (63). In 1914, Marie Jenny Howe, founder of Heterodoxy, defined feminism as "women's effort to break into the human race" (qtd. in Rosenberg, 1992: 65). She went on to state: "We intend simply to be ourselves, not just our little female selves, but our whole big human selves" (65). In Love in the Promised Land: The Story of Anzia Yezierska and John Dewey, Mary Dearborn discusses Yezierska's association with Heterodoxy. While acknowledging that Yezierska's official involvement with the club is not documented, Dearborn identifies some of Yezierska's closest friends as members of Heterodoxy, and summizes that Yezierska was "inevitably exposed to its views" (1988: 70).

Rose Pastor Stokes and Henrietta Rodman were among the Heterodoxy women with whom Yezierska formed close and enduring personal relationships (69, 72). A Russian immigrant, Pastor Stokes had captured the attention of the nation in 1905 by marrying the millionaire philanthropist and social worker James Graham Phelps Stokes. Despite her Madison Avenue marriage, Pastor Stokes remained committed to radical causes. A leading trade-unionist

and later, a member of the Communist Party (Rosenberg, 1992: 76), Pastor Stokes represented to Yezierska "the self-made American individuality that she herself sought" (Dearborn, 1988: 69). Henrietta Rodman was a teacher and an activist, and founder of the Feminist Alliance—a group committed to promoting the idea of married career women (Rosenberg, 1992: 66). Rodman was famous for successfully challenging the New York Board of Education's ban on married women holding teaching jobs. Although she never had children, she also campaigned for a maternity leave policy. In a 1969 interview, Yezierska said about Rodman: "To me she was a very great person because she conquered the thing that was an obstacle to her" (qtd. in Dearborn, 1988: 74). According to Dearborn, Rodman taught Yezierska "how to be a woman" (74), instead of "a woman with a big belly being such a glorious thing" (74).

In some ways, Yezierska did not need the ideas and the rhetoric of her friends to teach her about the "uncharted potential" of women (Rosenberg, 1992: 53). Early in her life, she recognized in herself the desire and the ability to transcend society's expectations of a female life. But her understanding of female potential must have been developed and extended through her close association with women like Pastor Stokes and Rodman. Various decisions Yezierska made in the 1910s—to leave two unsatisfactory marriages, to seek self-expression through writing, to surrender primary care of her daughter to her former husband so as to pursue a writing career—indicate the extent to which she may be described as "a woman of the times" (Dearborn, 1988: 75). Yezierska was also familiar with the radical ideas of Emma Goldman (Henriksen, 1988: 20), another significant Greenwich Village personality. A member of Heterodoxy and a high-profile public figure, who, like Yezierska, had an intimate, personal knowledge of life on the Lower East Side, Goldman was passionate about the plight of immigrant mothers in conventional family arrangements: "The old-time motherhood is to me the most terrible thing imposed upon woman. It has made her so unspeakably helpless and dependent, so self-centered and unsocial as to fill me with absolute horror" (qtd. in Burstein, 1996: 35). As a feminist activist, Goldman focused her attention on "the harshness of women's submission to the conventional family life" (Burstein, 1996: 55-6). As Yezierska became increasingly familiar with "the new freedom of the new woman" (76), it appears that she became increasingly aware of the plight of ghetto mothers who could not assert their individuality as the Heterodoxy feminists could, through "livelihood, personal relationships, habits of dress and living" (Lavender, 2002: 2). While Pastor Stokes and Rodman lobbied for political causes and legislative change, Yezierska—like Goldman became preoccupied with the oppression of female identity by the demands and protocols of Old World domesticity.

Immigrant mothers in Hungry Hearts: "The unstilled pain of life"

Turning her attention to the figure of the mother, Yezierska recognizes

typical female experiences of child-rearing in overcrowded, impoverished conditions. But she also draws attention to individual stories and individual needs. In "The Lost Beautifulness," Hanneh Hayyeh saves for years in order to buy the paint that will transform her tenement slum into something resembling an uptown mansion. By her own admission Hanneh Hayyeh has lived "like a pig" with her "nose to the earth, all the time only pinching and scraping for bread and rent" (Yezierska, 1991: 31-32). However, Hanneh Hayyeh stands out from the crowd. She is not just a laundress, she is "an artist laundress" with a "consuming passion for beauty" (35). Her transformation of her home is made possible by her awareness of something unique inside herself. Hanneh Hayyeh reveals that she was inspired by a red flower-pot, a gift from her wealthy employer Mrs Preston: "That flower-pot opened up the sky in my kitchen ... I used to talk to it like it could hear and feel and see. And I said to it: 'I'll show you what's in me. I'll show you I know what beautiful is.' [emphasis added]" (35). Hanneh Hayyeh clearly understands the implications of asserting herself as a subject: "When I see myself around the house how I fixed it up with my own hands, I forget I'm only a nobody. It makes me feel I'm also a person like Mrs. Preston" (32). It may be argued that Hanneh Hayyeh is motivated by her desire to be like Mrs Preston, and that her act of self-expression is actually an imitation, a copy. However, even if Hanneh Hayyeh's creative act is not original, it is still an expression of individuality. She lives in "a dark ill-smelling tenement" (33), in a neighbourhood crowded with similar buildings. But her home "lights up the whole tenement house for blocks around" (35). Hanneh Hayyeh has responded to something special inside her—a deep "love for the beautiful" (35)—and she has succeeded in distinguishing herself from others, in affirming herself as an individual.

At the end of "The Lost Beautifulness," Hanneh Hayyeh and her husband are huddled on the pavement with their belongings in the rain. They have been evicted from their home because of their inability to keep up the rent on the apartment that has escalated in value because of Hanneh Hayyeh's hard-won renovations. Hanneh Hayyeh has lost both her job and her home. The "lost beautifulness" refers to her destroyed kitchen—the havoc she has wrought as vengeance against her landlord. But it also describes Hanneh Hayyeh's inner desolation: "For every inch of the broken plaster there was a scar on her heart. She had destroyed that which had taken her so many years of prayer and longing to build up" (Yezierska, 1991: 42). Economic oppression has forced Hanneh Hayyeh to compromise the thing about her that made her special, that set her apart. The poignancy of the story comes from her painful recognition of what she has become. Earlier in the story, as she was starving herself in an effort to meet the landlord's demands, Hanneh Hayyeh had cried out to her employer, Mrs Preston: "Hunger and bitterness are making a wild animal out of me. I ain't no more the same Hanneh Hayyeh I used to be" (39). Hanneh Hayyeh's soul aches "with the unstilled pain of life" (42): an image of persistent, useless rebellion. She cannot ignore what is inside her and she rails against what she has been forced to give up. But her resistance is futile, and brings her further pain and grief.

"The Lost Beautifulness" is certainly a story of mother-love: Hanneh Hayyeh is driven by her desire to make a decent home for her son Aby, so that he will be able to "lift up his head in the world" and not have "to shame himself" when he invites people to his home (Yezierska, 1991: 31). She says to her husband: "I could tear the stars out from heaven for my Aby's wish" (32). And yet while she claims that "shining up the house" for Aby is her "only pleasure" (31), it is she who "soaks in the pleasure" from "every inch" of her kitchen (31). As the story progresses, it becomes clear that Hanneh Hayyeh's pleasure is not only the deflected pleasure of imagining Aby's surprise and gratification. The artist's appreciation is intrinsically hers: it is she who has the "consuming passion for beauty" (35), it is her eyes that possess "the hidden glow" of "the artist" (35). Her pain at the end of the story then is as much for herself as it is for her son. She had expressed herself in her beautiful kitchen and its destruction is felt as the destruction of her own "soul" (42). The "unstilled pain of life" represents her responsiveness to beauty that cannot be suppressed; a responsiveness that renders the destruction and dispossession even more unbearable.

Amongst the actions of mother-protagonists who appear in *Hungry* Hearts, Hanneh Hayyeh's painting of her kitchen stands out as the clearest example of dramatic self-expression. But there are other mothers in Hungry Hearts who possess an understanding of themselves as individuals and who value their right to autonomy. In "The Fat of the Land," Hannah Breineh struggles continuously to be recognised and treated as a person in her own right. As a young mother, battling poverty and hunger while trying to raise a large family in a tenement apartment, Hanneh Breineh constantly screams at and curses her children. In the midst of her cursing, she cries out for sympathy and understanding from her neighbour Mrs Pelz: "'Why comes it to me so hard?' Went on Hanneh Breineh, the tears streaming down her cheeks. 'I can't stand it no more. I came into you for a minute to run away from my troubles..." (Yezierska, 1991: 81). But Mrs Pelz, kind as she is, refuses to respond to Hanneh Breineh's particular tale of woe. She tries to be helpful and consoling, but her real sympathy lies with the children rather than the mother: "'Shah! Shah!' reproved Mrs Pelz. 'Pity yourself on the child ... See how frightened it looks on you.' Mrs Pelz took the child in her arms and petted it. 'The poor little lamb! What did it done you should hate it so?" (81). Mrs Pelz responds to the visible neglect of the child; she is moved by the plight of the vulnerability she can see and witness to. She is unable, however, to respond to or recognise the neglected needs of the mother. She cannot see that, in addition to being part of an oppressed immigrant under-class, Hanneh Breineh is an individual with a personal history of suffering:

"To whom can I open the wounds of my heart?" [Hanneh Breineh]

moaned. "Nobody has pity on me. You don't believe me, nobody believes me until I'll fall down like a horse in the middle of the street. Oi weh! Mine life is so black for my eyes!..." (Yezierska, 1991: 81)

In the second part of the story, Mrs Pelz comes to visit Hanneh Breineh, who is now living in an Uptown "palace" (Yezierska, 1991: 85). All her children have prospered and, as Mrs Pelz once predicted, Hanneh Breineh is living "on the fat of the land" (82). Yet in spite of her wealth and her life of ease, Hanneh Breineh is still suffering from neglect:

"Oi! Mrs Pelz; if you could only look into my heart! I'm so choked up! ... My children give me everything from the best. When I was sick, they got me a nurse by day and one by night ... but—but—I can't talk myself out in their language. They want to make me over for an American lady, and I'm different." Tears cut their way under her eyelids with a pricking pain as she went on: "When I was poor, I was free, and could holler and do what I like in my own house. Here I got to lie still like a mouse under a broom...." (Yezierska, 1991: 88)

To Mrs Pelz, she is "the Hanneh Breineh of old, ever discontented, ever complaining even in the midst of riches and plenty" (94). But Yezierska understands that Hanneh Breineh's discontent is legitimate and comes from the fact that, throughout her life, her needs have been overlooked: she has never been recognised or valued as a "person" in her own right, with an inner life. She is overwhelmed by loneliness because, as an individual with her own "thoughts and feelings" (94), she has been continually ignored:

"Why should my children shame themselves from me? From where did they get the stuff to work themselves up in the world? ... Why don't the children of born American mothers write my Benny's plays? It is I, who never had a chance to be a person, who gave him the fire in his head. If I would have had a chance to go to school and learn the language, what couldn't I have been?" (Yezierska, 1991: 94)

"The Fat of the Land" deals with the issue of generational conflict—"the struggle between parents and children by which an adult self is formed" (Dearborn, 1986: 72-3). Generational conflict is usually conveyed as the child's struggle against the parents—this is how Yezierska treats the theme in later stories and in her novel *Bread Givers*. It is important therefore that in this story, the narrative focus is on the *mother's* dilemma in maintaining her identity against the pressure from her children to conform to an accepted image of upper middle-class prosperity. Towards the end of the story, there is the striking image of Hanneh Breineh striding "proudly through the marble-paneled hall" of her Riverside Drive apartment block: "the market basket under her arm gave

forth the old, homelike odours of herring and garlic, while the scaly tail of a four-pound carp protruded from its newspaper wrapping" (Yezierska, 1991: 92). She flares up at the "uniformed hall-man, erect, expressionless, frigid with dignity" who discreetly tries to insist that her Delancey Street purchases come up through the trade entrance:

"Mind your own business!" she retorted. "I'll take it up myself. Do you think you're a Russian policeman to boss me in my own house?" ... "Ain't this America? Ain't this a free country? Can't I take up in my own house what I buy with my own money" ... (Yezierska, 1991: 92)

Hanneh Breineh will not be made into "an American lady" (Yezierska, 1991: 88). She is aware that she is "different" (88), but she will not surrender her identity to please her children and she will not be treated as a "dear old lady mother" (92) to be provided for, shuffled around and ignored.

The other protagonists of Yezierska's mother-narratives in Hungry Hearts are younger women. Distracted and fatigued, they do not have the forcefulness and the energy of Hanneh Breineh or Hanneh Hayyeh. But significantly Yezierska allows them to speak for themselves, and their first-person narrative immediately establishes the sense of an individual story. Sara in "Where Lovers Dream" is married with several children. Year earlier she had been jilted by her lover, David, who was soon to graduate as a doctor and who had been bullied by his benefactor uncle into rejecting Sara for a more socially acceptable wife. Sara ended up marrying Sam because "he came along and wanted me, and I didn't care about nothing no more" (Yezierska, 1991: 70). And yet despite her physical immersion in the difficulties and mundaneness of domestic life, Sara carries around in her head a clear scenario—an image of herself and an imaginary dialogue—that represents her attempt preserves her dignity and selfworth:

For years I was saying to myself—Just so you will act when you meet him. Just so you will stand. So will you look on him. These words you will say to him. I wanted to show him that what he had done to me could not down me; that his leaving me the way he left me, that his breaking my heart the way he broke it, didn't crush me ... (Yezierska, 1991: 62)

On the verge of a nervous breakdown, the unnamed mother in "The Free Vacation House" is sent by "the charities" to the country for a "rest and vacation" (Yezierska, 1991: 44). With their interrogative questioning and their long list of rules governing the mothers' behaviour, the charities make their recipients feel less than human: "like stupid cows" (46), "like tagged horses at a horse sale in the street" (47). The mother in this story feels the degradation of being denied individual rights and responsibilities as a deep and physical pain: "For why do they make it so hard for us? When a mother needs a vacation, why must they tear the inside out from her first...?" (49) When she returns to her tenement home, she is moved nearly to tears: "How good it was feeling for me to be able to move around my own house, like I pleased" (49). This young mother hates "the very same sameness" of domestic life—"what I'm having day in and day out at home" (49)—and yet she understands that freedom does not exist solely in being free from financial worries, or heavy work or depressing landscapes: "Even the high brick walls all around made me feel like a bird what just jumped out from a cage. And I cried out, 'Gott sei dank! Gott sei dank!" (49). She may be a "poor worn-out mother" (49)—an immigrant woman with a large family, reliant on help from social welfare—but she knows the importance of being treated as an individual and the preciousness of individual autonomy

Yezierska's involvement with modern feminism developed her attentiveness to the individual voice—to the individual story behind the collective tale of struggle and sacrifice. Carole Stone points out that Yezierska does not "valorize" her Jewish women characters, but rather "empowers them to speak as they are" (1999: 63). The stories discussed in this article go beyond telling the story of historical repression; they give imaginative expression to female individuality. Looking on the lives of immigrant mothers, Yezierska acknowledges the spark of life that distinguishes them as individuals. Her stories communicate the mothers' awareness of their individuality, and their painful, often futile struggle for recognition and self-expression In the coalescence of individuality and oppression in these early stories, it is possible to discern the germ of the idea of the woman as artist, which comes to be an important theme of Yezierska's later writing.

This article is dedicated to my mother, and to her mother.

¹See for example, JoAnn Pavletich (2000); Carole Stone (1999; Cara-Lynn Ungar, (1999); Chip Rhodes (1998); and Melanie Levinson (1994.

²These details about Yezierska's life are from Mary Dearborn's Love in the Promised Land: The Story of Anzia Yezierska and John Dewey (in particular chapters 2, 4 and 7) and Louise Levitas Henriksen's Anzia Yezierska: A Writer's Life (in particular chapters 1–5).

³In a recent study Writing Mothers, Writing Daughters: Tracing the Maternal in Stories by American Jewish Women, Janet Handler Burstein recognizes "unresolved developmental issues" between immigrant daughters and their mothers (1996: 38). In an earlier article, "The Hungry Jewish Mother" (1980), Erica Duncan maintains that immigrant women writers like Yezierska needed to face "the hungers that have crippled all women, all mothers in the old tradition" in order to "carry on the lives [their] mothers never gave themselves ..." (1989: 236).

⁴All references to Yezierska's stories are from the collection How I Found America, which includes the complete text of Hungry Hearts.

References

- Burstein, Janet Handler. 1996. Writing Mothers, Writing Daughters: Tracing the Maternal in Stories by American Jewish Women. Urbana: University of Illinois Press.
- Cott, Nancy. 1987. The Grounding of Modern Feminism. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Dearborn, Mary V. 1988. Love in the Promised Land: The Story of Anzia Yezierska and John Dewey. New York: The Free Press.
- Dearborn, Mary V. 1986. Pocahontas's Daughters: Gender and Ethnicity in American Culture. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Duncan, Erica. 1989. "The Hungry Jewish Mother." The Lost Tradition: Mothers and Daughters in Literature. Eds. Cathy N. Davidson and E. M. Broner. New York: Frederick Ungar Publishing Co.
- Henriksen, Louise Levitas. 1988. Anzia Yezierska: A Writer's Life. New Brunswick and London: Rutgers University Press.
- Lavender, Catherine. 2002. "The New Woman". Women in New York City, 1890-1940. http://scholar.library.csi.cuny.edu/users/lavender/386/ newwoman.html Date Accessed: 5 March.
- Levinson, Melanie. 1994 "To Make Myself for a Person: 'Passing' Narratives and the Divided Self in the Work of Anzia Yezierska." Studies in American Jewish Literature. 13: 2-9.
- Pavletich, JoAnn. 2000. "Anzia Yezierska, Immigrant Authority and the Uses of Affect." Tulsa Studies in Women's Literature 19 (1): 81-104.
- Rhodes, Chip. 1998. "Progressive Education, Essentialism and Ethnicity: Anzia Yezierska and Ludwig Lewisohn." Structures of the Jazz Age: Mass Culture, Progressive Education, and Racial Disclosures in American Modernism. London: Verso. 140-169.
- Rosenberg, Rosalind. 1982. Beyond Separate Spheres: Intellectual Roots of Modern Feminism. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Rosenberg, Rosalind. 1992. Divided Lives: American Women in the Twentieth Century. New York: Hill and Wang.
- Stone, Carole. 1999. "Immigrant Jewish Identity and the Female Voice: Anzia Yezierska and Grace Paley." Journal of the Short Story in English 32: 56-67.
- Ungar, Cara-Lynn. 1999. "Discourses of Class and the New Jewish Working Woman in Anzia Yezierska's Arrogant Beggar." Legacy 16 (1): 82-92.
- Yezierska, Anzia. 1991. How I Found America: Collected Stories of Anzia Yezierska. New York: Persea Books.